



Contents

ix	Acknowledgments
xi	Foreword
xv	Preface
xvii	Executive Summary
xxiii	Acronyms and Abbreviations
1	1 Introduction
	1 Background
	1 Objectives of the Review
	2 Caveats on the Scope of Review
	2 Inputs
	2 Organization of the Review
5	2 What Constitutes Good Practice?
	5 Historical Perspective
	5 Literature Review
	8 Bank Guidelines and Strategies
	10 Past IEG Recommendations and Management Response
	10 Framework for Evaluation
13	PART I ASSESSING BANK ASSISTANCE
15	3 Trends in Lending and Nonlending
	15 Overview
	16 Bank Lending for Financial Sector Reforms
	18 Focus of Financial Sector Reforms
	20 Bank Nonlending Assistance for Financial Sector Reforms
21	4 Regional Patterns of Bank Assistance
	22 Europe and Central Asia (ECA) Region Was the Most Active
	22 Africa (AFR) and Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) Regions Were Early Reformers

	24	East Asia and Pacific (EAP) Region Was Mostly Crisis Driven
	24	Middle East and North Africa (MNA) and South Asia (SAR) Regions Took Conservative Approaches
27	5	Quality-at-Entry of Bank Assistance
	27	Overview
	27	Quality-at-Entry in Lending
	29	Quality of Nonlending Services
	30	Consistency of Bank Approaches within Countries
	30	Coherence of Bank Approaches across Countries
33	6	Outcomes of Bank Loans and Credits
	33	Overview
	33	Financial Sector versus Multisector Loans
	36	Trends and Sequencing of Adjustment Loans
39	7	Bank Support to Crisis Countries
	39	Overview
	40	Did the Bank Anticipate the Crisis?
	42	Bank Response to Crises
	43	Objectives and Designing Loans
	44	Below-Average Achievement
	47	Collaboration with the IMF
	48	Effectiveness and Sustainability of the Bank's Crisis Unit
	48	Bank Leadership during Crisis
	49	Recommendations
51	PART II	ANALYZING RESULTS AT THE COUNTRY LEVEL
53	8	Country-Level Outputs: Ownership
	53	Overview
	53	Shift to Private Ownership
	53	Considerable Progress Has Been Made
	55	Privatization Far from Complete in Many Countries
	56	Quality Matters
	57	Better Outcomes with Prior Financial Restructuring
	58	Other Forms of Bank Restructuring
	59	Avoiding Buildup of NPLs
	59	Closure as an Alternative to Bank Privatization
	59	Privatization Took Longer Than Expected
	60	Unanticipated Problems
	60	Restructuring without Privatization Is Seldom Successful
	61	Recommendations on Restructuring and Privatizing Banks
63	9	Country-Level Outputs: Incentives
	63	Overview
	63	Changes in the Regulatory Regime Present a Mixed Picture
	64	Regulatory Framework in ECA Region Transition Countries
	65	Implementing Regulations and Better Banking Supervision
	66	Special Topic: Legal Immunity for Supervisors
	66	Special Topic: Deposit Insurance
	66	Recommendations on Improving the Incentive Framework

67	10 Country-Level Outcomes: Market Structure, Contestability, Efficiency, and Health
	67 Overview
	67 Changes in Market Structure: Bank Concentration
	68 Changes in Contestability
	70 Interest Rate Spread
	72 Health of the Financial System
75	11 Country-Level Impact: Financial Sector Depth and Stability
	75 Overview
	75 Financial Sector Depth: Positive Findings
	77 Systems Still Shallow in Many Countries
	77 Credit to the Private Sector
	79 Financial Sector Depth: Capital Markets
	79 Did Bank Borrowing Improve Stability?
83	12 Findings and Recommendations
	83 Findings
	86 Recommendations
89	Appendixes
	91 A: Data on Trends in Lending and Nonlending
	99 B: Outcome Ratings of Bank Loans
	103 C: Country-Level Outputs
	107 D: Reference Tables
	109 E: Country-Level Outcomes
	113 F: Definitions and Sources for IEG/DEC Model
	117 G: Management Response
	125 H: Chairman's Summary, Committee on Development Effectiveness (CODE)
129	Endnotes
135	References
	Boxes
	17 3.1 Identifying Bank Assistance for the Financial Sector
	20 3.2 Financial Sector Assessment Program (FSAP)
	23 4.1 Financial Sector Reforms in the ECA Region: Bank Strategy, Analysis, and Lending
	24 4.2 Bank Assistance to China
	25 4.3 Pakistan and Bangladesh: Commitments Explain Differences in Bank Lending
	28 5.1 Highly Relevant Objectives for Financial Sector Reforms
	30 5.2 Strong Consistency among Bank Products
	37 6.1 What a Difference a (Near) Crisis (Sometimes) Makes
	45 7.1 Objectives of Crisis Lending: Ambitious Reforms
	46 7.2 Mixed Outcomes
	47 7.3 Improved Coordination Needed between the World Bank and the IMF
	54 8.1 Problems Comparing Results among Countries
	56 8.2 Data on Bank Ownership Can Be Misleading
	57 8.3 Quality of the Buyer Matters

58	8.4	Absence of Prior Financial Restructuring Does Not Work Well
58	8.5	Empowerment of Asset Management Companies
60	8.6	Liquidations Have Been Difficult
60	8.7	Restructuring Banks without a Commitment to Change Ownership
65	9.1	Lack of Political Support: Algeria
69	10.1	IEG/DEC Model on Constructing a “Counterfactual”
72	10.2	Financial Reforms Can Affect Banking Health in Both Directions: Tunisia

Figures

10	2.1	Evaluation Framework
16	3.1	Bank Finance Loans as a Percentage of Total Bank Commitments, FY93–FY03
17	3.2	Bank Loans with Financial Sector Reforms, by Number of Loans, FY93–FY03
18	3.3	Types of Reforms as a Percentage of Bank Projects with Financial Sector Components
19	3.4	Investment Loans Supporting Financial Sector Reforms, by Year
20	3.5	ESW Reports Containing Financial Sector Analysis, by Count, FY93–FY03
34	6.1	Outcomes of Adjustment and TA Loans, FY93–FY03
34	6.2	Outcomes by Sector and Classification, by Number of Loans, FY93–FY03
35	6.3	Outcomes by Sector and CPIA Ratings, by Number of Loans, FY93–FY03
36	6.4	Outcomes by Country Characteristics, FY93–FY03
38	6.5	Outcomes of Adjustment Loans, with and without Technical Assistance
46	7.1	Outcomes of Adjustment Loans, Crisis versus Noncrisis Lending
54	8.1	Changes in Government Ownership of Banks
68	10.1	Bank Concentrations in Countries That Borrowed for Financial Reforms, 1993–2001
71	10.2	Changes in Foreign Ownership
71	10.3	Median Interest Rate Spreads in Countries That Borrowed, 1992–2002
76	11.1	Financial Sector Depth and Liquidity Preference in Countries That Borrowed for Financial Reforms, 1992–2002
78	11.2	Credit to the Private Sector in Countries That Borrowed for Financial Reforms, 1992–2002
80	11.3	Market Capitalization and Value of Stocks Traded in Countries, 1992–2002

Tables

17	3.1	Lending for Financial Sector Reforms, FY93–FY03
19	3.2	Investment Lending with Financial Sector Components, by Category, FY93–FY03
21	4.1	Lending Categorized as Finance, Percent of Total, FY93–FY03
22	4.2	Lending with Financial Sector Components, FY93–FY03
23	4.3	Regional Concentration of Reforms
29	5.1	QAG Assessment of ESW Quality, FY98–FY02

32	5.2	Bank Loans Supporting Deposit Insurance, by Fiscal Year
34	6.1	Outcomes of Financial Sector Lending and Components, FY93–FY03
37	6.2	Outcomes of Adjustment Loans, by Period and Sequence
42	7.1	International Rescue Efforts and Bank Responses
44	7.2	Crisis Loans with Financial Sector Components
45	7.3	Postcrisis Adjustment Operations with Financial Sector Components
55	8.1	Changes in Government Ownership, with and without TA
55	8.2	Changes in Bank Ownership
64	9.1	Capital Adequacy and Loan Classification, Changes between 1998 and 2003
65	9.2	Indicators on Strength of Financial Regulations in Transition Countries
70	10.1	Annual Growth Rates in Banking Sector Concentrations
70	10.2	Changes in Contestability
72	10.3	Annual Growth Rates in Interest Rate Spreads
73	10.4	Measures of Banking Health in Borrowing versus Nonborrowing Countries
77	11.1	Annual Growth Rates in Financial Sector Depth and Confidence in the Banking System
77	11.2	Distribution of Changes in Measures of Financial Sector Depth in Borrowing Countries
78	11.3	Annual Growth Rates for Credit to the Private Sector
79	11.4	Distribution of Changes in Access to Credit in Borrowing Countries
80	11.5	Distribution of Changes in Capital Market Measures
81	11.6	Number of Countries with and without Systemic Insolvency