

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Abbreviations	xi
Chapter 1: Introduction and Summary: Skills Upgrading and Innovation Policies	1
Productivity, Educational, and Technology Gaps in Latin America and the Caribbean	2
From Financing Gaps to Productivity Gaps: Closing the Gap in Education and Technology in a Synchronized Way	7
Students, Workers, and Firms: The Major Actors of Educational and Technological Progress	9
The Role of Government Policy	10
The Critical Importance of Effective Innovation Networks	10
Closing the Skill Gaps	12
Closing the Technology and Productivity Gaps	15
Summing Up	20
Endnotes	21
Chapter 2: The Gaps That Matter Most	23
The Productivity Gap	23
The Skill Gap	24
The Technology Gap	32
Conclusion: Benchmarking Latin American Performance	40
Endnotes	46
Chapter 3: How Technology and Skills Interact: The Evidence for Latin America and the Caribbean	49
The Rising Demand for Skilled Workers in Latin America	49
Skill-Biased Technological Change in Latin America	55
The Relationship between Technology Transfer, the Rising Demand for Skills in Latin America, and Patterns of Integration into the Global Economy	63
The Level of Skill in a Country Is an Important Determinant of Technology Transferred from Abroad	67
Long-Term Cycles in the Demand for Skilled Workers and Technology?	70
Conclusion	72
Endnotes	72
Chapter 4: Closing the Skills Gap: Education Policies	75
Educational Transitions: The How	76
Educational Transitions: The (Uncertain) Why	80
Educational Transitions: Policy Implications	86
Understanding the Education Market: Secondary School	86
Understanding the Education Market: Universities	95
Conclusion: Priorities for Education Upgrading in Latin America	104
Endnotes	106
Chapter 5: Closing the Skills Gap: Training Policies	109
Vocational Education and Training Systems in Latin America	110
How Employers View Training	117
Correlates of In-Service Training: Evidence from Mexico	120

Policies to Promote Training	125
Summary	130
Endnotes	131
Chapter 6: Technological Transitions and Elements of Technology Policy	133
Rationale for Government Action: Market and Coordination Failures	134
Developing Technological Capabilities	135
Policies for the First Stage of Transition: Spillovers, Diffusion Mechanisms, and Incipient and Selective R&D	138
LAC's Performance	144
Advanced Technological Transition: R&D as the Key Driver	151
The Structure of R&D in LAC	161
Conclusion	167
Endnotes	168
Chapter 7: Networks and National Innovation Systems	169
National Innovations Systems: Coherence and Incentives	170
Benchmarking the LAC NIS	173
Indicators of Innovation Outcomes	173
Efficiency of Use of Resources and Collaboration	178
University/Research Center/Firm Linkages: The Core of the NIS	180
Policies to Improve Collaboration	187
Policies to Foment Interfirm Collaboration in Innovation	190
Science Parks and Incubators in LAC	192
International Networks	194
Conclusion	198
Annex	200
Endnotes	202
Bibliography:	203
Boxes	
Box 1.1 Unlocking Productivity: The Knowledge Economy Decomposed	4
Box 1.2 Lessons in Contrast: Exploiting Technology-Skill Complementarities	8
Box 1.3 The Importance of Diversity and Leaders	20
Box 2.1 Benchmarking Latin America	24
Box 3.1 Data Sources	50
Box 3.2 Measuring Education, Relative Wages, and Relative Supply	52
Box 3.3 Constructing Relative Demand Shifts: What Needs to Be Assumed and Why	56
Box 3.4 Scale, Technological Change, and Human Capital: Manufacturing and Development in Mexico	63
Box 3.5 Evidence of Skill-Biased Technological Change in the United States and other OECD Countries	66
Box 3.6 Trade Liberalization and Sector-Specific Skill-Biased Technological Change in Brazil	68
Box 4.1 Expanding Secondary School: The Great Transformation of American Education	87
Box 4.2 The Returns to Investments in School Infrastructure: Evidence from Peru and Indonesia	94
Box 4.3 Conditional Cash Transfers: The Impact of PROGRESA in Mexico	94
Box 4.4 How Information Technology Has Changed the Workplace: Evidence from the OECD	100
Box 4.5 Student Loan Schemes	103
Box 4.6 Minimizing Information Problems about Private University Providers: Experiences from Latin America	105
Box 5.1 Mexico's CONALEP: How to Make a Vocational Education Institution Work	114
Box 5.2 Lifelong Learning: Concept, Evidence for LAC, and Implications	115
Box 5.3 World Business Environment Surveys	117
Box 5.4 Enterprise Training and Productivity in Developing Countries	121
Box 5.5 Firm-Level Cross-Section and Panel Data for Mexico	121
Box 5.6 Complementarities between Skills and Technology: Training Interventions to Boost Firm Productivity in Malaysia	126
Box 5.7 Well-Designed Levy-Grant Schemes Can Motivate Firms to Train	128
Box 5.8 Mexico's Proactive Approach to Small and Medium-Size Enterprise Support	129

Box 5.9	Recent Changes in Training Systems in Latin America and the Caribbean	131
Box 6.1	The Dual Role of R&D: Innovation and Learning	140
Box 6.2	Supply-Side and Demand-Side Measures to Improve Technology Diffusion	141
Box 6.3	Singapore's Reliance on FDI	147
Box 6.4	The Role of Intellectual Property Rights (IPRs) in Technology Transfer	153
Box 6.5	Managing Intellectual Property Rights (IPRs)	156
Box 6.6	TRIPS: Developing Countries' Concerns Regarding the Universalization of IPRs	157
Box 6.7	Human Capital, IPRs, and R&D Policies as Determinants of Private R&D and Their Impact on TFP—Methodology and Results	160
Box 6.8	The Contrasting Approaches to R&D by Korea and Mexico	167
Box 7.1	Venture Human Capital in the United States and Israel	172
Box 7.2	Jump-starting a National Innovation Effort: The NIS in Israel and Finland	179
Box 7.3	Build a Better Mouse and the World Will Beat a Path to Your Door (or Is Playing God a Low-Tech Activity?)	180
Box 7.4	What Is a College Education For?	183
Box 7.5	Did the Bayh-Dole Act Increase the Commercialization of Publicly Funded Research?	186
Box 7.6	The Cluster Approach of Finnish R&D Policy	190
Box 7.7	Research Consortia in Japan: Did They Work?	191
Box 7.8	The Israel Magnet Program	193
Box 7.9	Migration as a Vector of Innovation	194
Box 7.10	Return Migration in Israel and Ireland	196
Box 7.11	Deficient Brain Drain in Brazil	198
Box 7.12	Catalyzing an Innovation Cluster: The Millennium Science Initiative in Chile	199
Box 7.13	The Perils of Intellectual Autarky, the Rewards of Trade	200

Tables

Table 1.1	The Gaps That Matter Most	6
Table 1.2	First Stage	16
Table 1.3	Second Stage	17
Table 1.4	Third Stage	19
Table 2.1	TFP Growth Rates in Latin America Were Negative in the 1980s and Low in the 1990s	25
Table 2.2	In the 1980s and 1990s, Growth Rates of TFP Were High in Chile and Low in Most Other Latin American Countries	26
Table 2.3	Compared to East Asia and the Natural Resource–Abundant Countries, Latin America Has Low Levels and an Unequal Distribution of Educational Attainment among the Adult Population	28
Table 2.4	Many Countries in Latin America Have Massive Secondary Enrollment Deficits, and Some Have Smaller Tertiary Enrollment Deficits	30
Table 2.5	Countries in Latin America Have Low Import Penetration, Low Penetration of Capital Goods, and Low Levels of Royalty Payments	36
Table 2.6	Latin American Workers Have Small Amounts of R&D Expenditures	40
Table 2.7	Residents of Most Latin American Countries Have Low Rates of Patent Registration in Their Own Countries as well as in the United States	42
Table 2.8	The Gaps That Matter Most	45
Table 3.1	The Bulk of Changes in the Wage Bill for Tertiary Workers and Secondary Workers Occurred <i>within</i> Industries	60
Table 3.2	By and Large, Skill Upgrading at the Tertiary Level Occurred in the Same Sectors in Chile in the 1980s and in Other Latin American Countries in the 1990s	61
Table 3.3	In Chile Firms That Were Exposed to New Technology from Abroad Also Upgraded Skills	62
Table 3.4	There Is More Skill Upgrading, Measured by the Relative Wages, Relative Employment Shares, and Relative Demand for Tertiary Workers, in Countries and Industries That Have Higher Import Penetration, Especially of Imports That Are Intensive in R&D	67
Table 3.5	Countries in Latin America with More Skilled Workers Are Better Prepared to Adopt New Technologies	68
Table 3.6	Wage Inequality Increased with Increases in Demand for Skilled Workers	71
Table 4.1	From Pyramid to Diamond in East Asia and Scandinavia	80
Table 4.2	From Pyramid <i>toward</i> Diamond in Some Latin American Countries	81

Box 5.9	Recent Changes in Training Systems in Latin America and the Caribbean	131
Box 6.1	The Dual Role of R&D: Innovation and Learning	140
Box 6.2	Supply-Side and Demand-Side Measures to Improve Technology Diffusion	141
Box 6.3	Singapore's Reliance on FDI	147
Box 6.4	The Role of Intellectual Property Rights (IPRs) in Technology Transfer	153
Box 6.5	Managing Intellectual Property Rights (IPRs)	156
Box 6.6	TRIPS: Developing Countries' Concerns Regarding the Universalization of IPRs	157
Box 6.7	Human Capital, IPRs, and R&D Policies as Determinants of Private R&D and Their Impact on TFP—Methodology and Results	160
Box 6.8	The Contrasting Approaches to R&D by Korea and Mexico	167
Box 7.1	Venture Human Capital in the United States and Israel	172
Box 7.2	Jump-starting a National Innovation Effort: The NIS in Israel and Finland	179
Box 7.3	Build a Better Mouse and the World Will Beat a Path to Your Door (or Is Playing God a Low-Tech Activity?)	180
Box 7.4	What Is a College Education For?	183
Box 7.5	Did the Bayh-Dole Act Increase the Commercialization of Publicly Funded Research?	186
Box 7.6	The Cluster Approach of Finnish R&D Policy	190
Box 7.7	Research Consortia in Japan: Did They Work?	191
Box 7.8	The Israel Magnet Program	193
Box 7.9	Migration as a Vector of Innovation	194
Box 7.10	Return Migration in Israel and Ireland	196
Box 7.11	Deficient Brain Drain in Brazil	198
Box 7.12	Catalyzing an Innovation Cluster: The Millennium Science Initiative in Chile	199
Box 7.13	The Perils of Intellectual Autarky, the Rewards of Trade	200

Tables

Table 1.1	The Gaps That Matter Most	6
Table 1.2	First Stage	16
Table 1.3	Second Stage	17
Table 1.4	Third Stage	19
Table 2.1	TFP Growth Rates in Latin America Were Negative in the 1980s and Low in the 1990s	25
Table 2.2	In the 1980s and 1990s, Growth Rates of TFP Were High in Chile and Low in Most Other Latin American Countries	26
Table 2.3	Compared to East Asia and the Natural Resource—Abundant Countries, Latin America Has Low Levels and an Unequal Distribution of Educational Attainment among the Adult Population	28
Table 2.4	Many Countries in Latin America Have Massive Secondary Enrollment Deficits, and Some Have Smaller Tertiary Enrollment Deficits	30
Table 2.5	Countries in Latin America Have Low Import Penetration, Low Penetration of Capital Goods, and Low Levels of Royalty Payments	36
Table 2.6	Latin American Workers Have Small Amounts of R&D Expenditures	40
Table 2.7	Residents of Most Latin American Countries Have Low Rates of Patent Registration in Their Own Countries as well as in the United States	42
Table 2.8	The Gaps That Matter Most	45
Table 3.1	The Bulk of Changes in the Wage Bill for Tertiary Workers and Secondary Workers Occurred <i>within</i> Industries	60
Table 3.2	By and Large, Skill Upgrading at the Tertiary Level Occurred in the Same Sectors in Chile in the 1980s and in Other Latin American Countries in the 1990s	61
Table 3.3	In Chile Firms That Were Exposed to New Technology from Abroad Also Upgraded Skills	62
Table 3.4	There Is More Skill Upgrading, Measured by the Relative Wages, Relative Employment Shares, and Relative Demand for Tertiary Workers, in Countries and Industries That Have Higher Import Penetration, Especially of Imports That Are Intensive in R&D	67
Table 3.5	Countries in Latin America with More Skilled Workers Are Better Prepared to Adopt New Technologies	68
Table 3.6	Wage Inequality Increased with Increases in Demand for Skilled Workers	71
Table 4.1	From Pyramid to Diamond in East Asia and Scandinavia	80
Table 4.2	From Pyramid <i>toward</i> Diamond in Some Latin American Countries	81

Table 4.3	From Pyramid to Anvil in Other Latin American Countries	84
Table 4.4	Education Spending as a Fraction of GDP Is <i>Not</i> Low in Most Latin American Countries	84
Table 4.5	The Opportunity Cost of Attending Secondary School Appears to Be <i>High</i> in Most Latin American Countries	88
Table 4.6	High Rates of Return to Tertiary Education, and Modest Rates to Secondary School in Most of Latin America	88
Table 4.7	There Is Generally Little Variation in Primary School Student Performance on Test Scores within Latin America, with the Exception of Cuba	89
Table 4.8	Tertiary Enrollments Have Been Growing since the 1970s	95
Table 4.9	... and Have Continued to Grow in the 1990s	95
Table 5.1	A Typology of Training Systems	112
Table 5.2	Differences between Lifelong Learning and Traditional Education	115
Table 5.3	Estimated Productivity Effects of Formal Training	121
Table 5.4	Rationale and Policy Options for Public Intervention in Training	126
Table 6.1	Impact of Trade on LAC Countries and Education Effect	142
Table 6.2	Impact through Trade of a 10 Percent Increase in Education on TFP Growth Rate, 1998	142
Table 6.3	Effects on Foreign Direct Investment	143
Table 6.4	Human Capital Threshold Required for Positive Impact of FDI	144
Table 6.5	Non-Tariff Barriers Levels for LAC and East Asian Countries	145
Table 6.6	Index of Foreign Investment Barriers, 2000	146
Table 6.7	Evolution of Total R&D Expenditures as a Percentage of GDP, 1960–99	152
Table 6.8	Transitions of Strength of Patent Protection—IPR—for Selected Countries, 1960–2000	154
Table 6.9	Tax Credits versus Matching Grants	159
Table 6.10	Evolution of the Ratio of Private to Public R&D Expenditures, 1980–95	159
Table 6.11	Determinants of Private R&D Per Worker in LAC and Other Countries: Elasticities	160
Table 6.12	Intellectual Property Rights Index, 1995	162
Table 6.13	Fiscal Incentives Regimes for R&D as of 2000	164
Table 6.14	R&D Expenditure by Activity (in percentages)	166
Table 6.15	Patterns of R&D Expenditures: LAC versus OECD and East Asian Tigers, Averages for 2000	167
Table 6.16	Similarity of Education Patterns in LAC (1990s) versus Technology-Successful Economies (1980)	168
Table 7.1	Potential Benchmarks for the LAC NIS: A Wish List	174
Table 7.2	Determinants of Patenting in the United States	181
Table 7.3	Tentative Benchmarks of Interaction of Higher Education (HE) and Public Laboratories (PL) with Firms	185
Table 7.4	Guidelines for Sharing Royalties from IPRs	187
Table 7.5	Policies for Improving Academic/Private Sector Collaboration	187
Table 7A.1	Social Rates of Return to R&D	201

Figures

Figure 1.1	The Knowledge Economy Simplified	3
Figure 1.2	The Latin America and the Caribbean Region's Deficits in Technology and Education Relative to East Asia (1980–99)	5
Figure 1.3	A Problem in Many LAC Countries: Massive Deficits on Secondary Education	6
Figure 1.4	A Simple National Innovation System (NIS)	11
Figure 1.5	Educational Transitions	13
Figure 1.6	Superstars in R&D	18
Figure 1.7	Returns to R&D and Physical Capital	18
Figure 2.1	Most Latin American Countries Have Low Levels of Educational Attainment of Their Adult Population	27
Figure 2.2	Many Countries in Latin America Have <i>Massive</i> Deficits in Secondary Enrollment	29
Figure 2.3	Some Countries Also Have Large Deficits in Tertiary Enrollment, although These Are Generally Smaller	31
Figure 2.4	Colombian and Chilean Secondary School Students Perform Badly on International Tests	32
Figure 2.5	Chilean Adults Also Do Badly on International Tests of Literacy	33
Figure 2.6	Some Latin American Countries Appear to Have Low Numbers of Scientists and Engineers for Their Income Levels, but Others Do Not	34
Figure 2.7	Most Countries in the Region Do <i>Not</i> Appear to Have an Important Deficit in the Fraction of University Students Enrolled in Science and Engineering	35

Figure 2.8	In the 1980s East Asia Opened Up a Big Lead over Latin America in the Degree of Computer Penetration	37
Figure 2.9	The Digital Divide between East Asia and Latin America Did Not Shrink in the 1990s	38
Figure 2.10	Latin America Also Lags behind East Asia in Other Measures of ICT Infrastructure	39
Figure 2.11	Latin American Countries Also Have Low Levels of R&D Per Worker	41
Figure 2.12	The Rates of Patent Registration by Latin American Inventors Are <i>Low</i> for Their Levels of Per Capita Income	43
Figure 2.13	The Widening of the LAC Technology Gap: Regional Comparisons of Index Scores	44
Figure 2.14	Between 1960 and 2000, the East Asian Tigers Turned a Deficit in the Mean Years of Schooling into a Surplus, while the Deficit in Latin America Did Not Change	45
Figure 2.15	Between the 1960s and the 1990s, the East Asian Tigers Turned a Deficit in the Mean Number of Patents Per Worker Registered in the United States into a Surplus, while the Deficit in Latin America Did Not Change	46
Figure 3.1	The Relative Wages and Relative Supply of Workers with <i>Tertiary</i> Education Increased Substantially in Most Latin American Countries	51
Figure 3.2	The Relative Supply of Workers with <i>Secondary</i> Education Increased Substantially in Latin America	54
Figure 3.3	The Demand for <i>Tertiary</i> Workers Increased in Every Country except Brazil	57
Figure 3.4	The Demand for <i>Secondary</i> Workers Increased in Every Country except Argentina and Brazil	58
Figure 3.5	Tariffs Decreased and Import Penetration Increased in a Number of Latin American Countries in the 1980s and 1990s	64
Figure 3.6	FDI Flows Increased Significantly in a Number of Latin American Countries	65
Figure 3.7	The Long-Term Cycles in Relative Demand in Latin America	70
Figure 4.1	Education Transitions	77
Figure 4.2	The Distribution of Educational Attainment Was Similar in Brazil, Spain, and Korea in 1960	78
Figure 4.3	Fast, Balanced Transitions in the East Asian Tigers and Finland	79
Figure 4.4	Balanced but Slow Transitions in Some Latin American Countries	82
Figure 4.5	<i>Unbalanced</i> and Slow Transitions in Other Latin American Countries	83
Figure 4.6	There Is No Clear Relationship between Changes in Education Expenditure and Changes in Attainment in Latin America	85
Figure 4.7	There Is No Clear Relationship between Education Quality and Quantity in Latin America	90
Figure 4.8	Patterns of Educational Attainment in Guatemala, Nicaragua, and Peru	92
Figure 4.9	Supply and Demand Factors in the Evolution of Educational Attainment in Colombia, 1990–2000	93
Figure 4.10	The Rising Share of the Private Sector in the University Market	96
Figure 4.11	Private Tertiary Education Is More Expensive to Households	97
Figure 4.12	Conditional on Enrollment, Students from Poorer Households Are Less Likely to Attend Private Universities	98
Figure 4.13	The Wages of Workers with “Scientific” Degrees Relative to Those with “Humanistic” Degrees in Mexico Have Not Changed in the 1990s	101
Figure 4.14	Cost Recovery in Public Universities Is Low in Many Latin American Countries	102
Figure 5.1	Education and Training Systems around the World	111
Figure 5.2	Wage Profiles in Brazil, Colombia, and Mexico—Early and Late 1990s	116
Figure 5.3	The Supply of Skilled Labor Is a Leading Constraint to Productivity in Latin America and the Caribbean	118
Figure 5.4	Use of Mature Technologies and Availability of Skilled Workers Are the Main Reasons Why Firms in Latin America Do Not Invest in Formal Training	119
Figure 5.5	Knowledge of Training Providers and Resource Considerations Are More Important Constraints for Micro-Enterprises, Guatemala 2000	120
Figure 5.6	Almost 50 Percent of Training in Latin America Is Internal to Enterprises, and Another 40 Percent is Privately Supplied	120
Figure 5.7	In Mexico, Educated Workers Get Trained More Often	122
Figure 5.8	... and More Innovative Firms Train Their Workers More	123
Figure 5.9	In Mexico, Two-Thirds of Training Is Internal	123
Figure 5.10	... and About Half of the Rest Is by Private Providers	124
Figure 5.11	In Mexico, Training Increases with Greater Openness, but Only if Firms Conduct R&D	125
Figure 5.12	Training, Especially if It Is More Continuous, Facilitates TFP Increases	125
Figure 6.1	R&D Effort, Licensing, and Development: Predictions from Median Regressions	136
Figure 6.2	Innovation and Development	136

Figure 6.3	Mean Tariff Barriers (percent), 1990 and 1999	144
Figure 6.4	Foreign Direct Investment, 1989 and 1999	146
Figure 6.5	High-Achieving LAC Countries	149
Figure 6.6	Low-Achieving LAC Countries	150
Figure 6.7	Evolution of R&D/GDP Expenditures on GDP Per Capita 1980–1995	152
Figure 6.8	Patent Rights and Privately Financed R&D (1980–95 average for 58 countries)	161
Figure 6.9	Researchers, 1999	163
Figure 6.10	Financing of R&D Expenditures, 1999	165
Figure 6.11	Gross R&D Expenses by Executing Sector, 1994–98	165
Figure 6.12	Private R&D Performance and Experimental Development	166
Figure 7.1	A Simple NIS	170
Figures 7.2A–F	Patenting, Licenses, and Royalties and R&D Benchmarking	176
Figure 7.3	R&D Expenditure and R&D Financed by the Productive Sector: Taiwan (China), Korea, Finland, and Israel	177
Figure 7.4	Predicted and Observed R&D/GDP	177
Figure 7.5	Returns to R&D and Physical Capital	178
Figure 7.6	Inefficiency of LAC Countries in Patenting in the United States	181
Figure 7.7	Allocation of R&D Resources	183
Figure 7.8	Quality of Scientific Research Institutions and University Industry Research Collaboration	184
Figure 7.9	Brazil and Mexico: IRCA in Aircraft and Computing Equipment	189
Figure 7.10	Student Migration Rate: 1993–98	195
Figure 7.11	Brain Circulation: Migration/Population with Tertiary Education	197