

# Contents

<b>FOREWORD</b>	<b>xv</b>
<b>EDITORS' PREFACE</b>	<b>xvii</b>
<b>CONTRIBUTORS AND DISCUSSANTS</b>	<b>xix</b>
<b>ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS</b>	<b>xxiii</b>
<b>PART I: INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1. BUDGET SUPPORT: CONCEPT AND ISSUES</b>	<b>3</b>
<i>Stefan Koeberle and Zoran Stavreski</i>	
A. Context for the Emergence of Budget Support	3
B. Definitions, Key Characteristics, and Rationale for Budget Support	5
C. When Is Budget Support Appropriate?	10
D. Key Issues in Design and Implementation	16
E. Summary and Conclusions	23
<b>2. MANAGING FIDUCIARY ISSUES IN BUDGET SUPPORT OPERATIONS</b>	<b>27</b>
<i>David Shand</i>	
A. Fiduciary and Developmental Objectives: Two Sides of the Same Coin	28
B. Issues in Fiduciary Risk	32
C. Using Public Financial Management Diagnostic Information	34
D. Measuring and Calibrating Fiduciary Risk	35
E. Strategies to Manage and Mitigate Fiduciary Risk	37
F. Is Budget Support Improving PFM?	40
<b>PART II: RECENT EVALUATIONS OF BUDGET SUPPORT</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>3. POVERTY REDUCTION SUPPORT CREDITS (PRSC): A STOCKTAKING</b>	<b>47</b>
<i>John M. Factora</i>	
A. Operationalizing the PRSP	49
B. PRSP Alignment: Content and Coverage	56
C. Harmonization and Predictability	65
D. Conclusions	78

<b>4.</b>	<b>EUROPEAN COMMISSION BUDGET SUPPORT: AN INNOVATIVE APPROACH TO CONDITIONALITY</b>	<b>81</b>
	<i>Directorate General for Development</i>	
	A. The European Commission's Approach: How Does it Work?	81
	B. EC Approach: What is the Rationale?	83
	C. EC Approach: What Does the Review of Experience to Date Show?	85
<b>5.</b>	<b>A FRAMEWORK FOR EVALUATING GENERAL BUDGET SUPPORT</b>	<b>91</b>
	<i>Mike A. Hammond</i>	
	A. Evolving Goals of Budget Support	91
	B. Purpose, Subject, and Scope of the Evaluation	93
	C. The Evaluation Framework	95
	D. Implementing the Evaluation	98
<b>6.</b>	<b>GENERAL BUDGET SUPPORT: KEY FINDINGS OF FIVE USAID STUDIES</b>	<b>105</b>
	<i>Development Information Services</i>	
	A. Issues Analyzed	106
	B. Conclusions	116
<b>7.</b>	<b>DOES GENERAL BUDGET SUPPORT WORK? EVIDENCE FROM TANZANIA</b>	
	<i>Andrew Lawson, David Booth, Meleki Msuya, Samuel Wangwe, and Tim Williamson</i>	
	A. How Can We Judge Success?	121
	B. The Tanzanian Context	122
	C. Findings	122
	D. Overall Conclusions	135
	E. Learning from Tanzania	136
<b>8.</b>	<b>GENERAL BUDGET SUPPORT AND PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT REFORM: EMERGING LESSONS FROM TANZANIA AND UGANDA</b>	<b>139</b>
	<i>Tim Williamson</i>	
	A. The Hypothesis	139
	B. Direct Effects of General Budget Support Funding in Tanzania and Uganda on Public Financial Management Outcomes	141
	C. Major Factors behind Improvements in Public Financial Management Systems	146
	D. The Role of Nonfinancial General Budget Support Inputs in Improving Public Financial Management Systems	147
	E. Conclusions and Their Implications	149
	<b>PART III: ALIGNING BUDGET SUPPORT WITH COUNTRY PROGRAMS</b>	<b>153</b>
<b>9.</b>	<b>PRSPS AND BUDGETS: A SYNTHESIS OF FIVE CASE STUDIES</b>	<b>155</b>
	<i>Rosa Alonso, Lindsay Judge, and Jeni Klugman</i>	

A.	Data Production, Availability, and Use	157
B.	Budget Formulation and the PRSP—Has the PRSP Process Increased the Openness and Transparency of the Budget Process?	163
C.	Accountability for Expenditures and Results	173
D.	Costing and Consistency with Overall Macroeconomic Framework	177
E.	Donor Coordination and Alignment with PRS Priorities and Predictability and Variability of External Financing	186
F.	Conclusions	189
<b>10.</b>	<b>RECONCILING ALIGNMENT AND PERFORMANCE IN BUDGET SUPPORT PROGRAMS: WHAT NEXT?</b>	<b>193</b>
	<i>David Booth, Karin Christiansen, and Paolo de Renzio</i>	
A.	The Broad Problem: PRSPs as a Two-sided Deal	194
B.	The Particular Problem: PRSP Annual Progress Reports and Performance Assessment Frameworks for Budget Support	196
C.	Why PRSP Monitoring Is Not Working	199
D.	Reforming Performance Assessment Frameworks: Toward Results-based Conditionality?	203
E.	The Alternative	205
F.	Conclusion	208
	<b>PART IV: PREDICTABILITY OF BUDGET SUPPORT</b>	<b>213</b>
<b>11.</b>	<b>PREDICTABILITY OF BUDGET AID: RECENT EXPERIENCES</b>	<b>215</b>
	<i>Oya Celasun and Jan Walliser</i>	
A.	Data on Budget Aid	217
B.	Budget Aid Flows: How Unpredictable Are They?	220
C.	Intrayear Predictability of Budget Aid	225
D.	Conclusions	226
<b>12.</b>	<b>IMPROVING THE DYNAMICS OF AID: TOWARD MORE PREDICTABLE BUDGET SUPPORT</b>	<b>229</b>
	<i>Benn Eifert and Alan Gelb</i>	
A.	Aid Instability: Some Stylized Facts	232
B.	Cushioning Expenditures through Reserve Management and Fiscal Rules	236
C.	How Risky Are Multiyear Aid Commitments?	241
D.	Calibrating Budget Support: Performance Levels versus Changes?	252
E.	Developing Performance-based Norms to Guide Aid Allocations	255
F.	Conclusion	265
	<b>PART V: BUDGET SUPPORT COORDINATION AND CONDITIONALITY</b>	<b>265</b>
<b>13.</b>	<b>WORLD BANK CONDITIONALITY: TRENDS, LESSONS, AND GOOD PRACTICE PRINCIPLES</b>	<b>267</b>
	<i>Stefan Koeberle and Jan Walliser</i>	
A.	Conditionality: Definitions, Modalities, and Approaches	268
B.	Trends in World Bank Conditionality	272
C.	Applying Conditionality	276

	D. Key Messages of the Conditionality Review	284
	E. Good Practice Principles	286
<b>14.</b>	<b>BUDGET SUPPORT, CONDITIONALITY, AND IMPACT EVALUATION</b>	<b>295</b>
	<i>Jan Willem Gunning</i>	
	A. The Case for Results-based Aid	295
	B. Aid as a Contract	297
	C. Implementing Results-based Aid: Design and Experience	301
	D. Shocks, Results, and Predictability	303
	E. Impact Evaluation	306
	F. Conclusion	308
<b>15.</b>	<b>TRUST, CONDITIONALITY, AND AID EFFECTIVENESS</b>	<b>311</b>
	<i>Paul Mosley and Suleiman Abrar</i>	
	A. Intuitive Foundations	312
	B. The Model	316
	C. Econometric Tests	321
	D. Evidence from Case Studies	324
	E. Policy Conclusions and Recommendations	330
<b>16.</b>	<b>FUNGIBILITY, PRIOR ACTIONS, AND ELIGIBILITY FOR BUDGET SUPPORT</b>	<b>333</b>
	<i>Oliver Morrissey</i>	
	A. Approaches to Improving Aid Effectiveness	333
	B. A Model of Selectivity through Prior Actions	335
	C. Government Spending: Fungibility, Allocation, and Effectiveness	339
	D. Conclusions and Policy Implications	341
	Good Practice Note on Harmonization	344
	Good Practice Note on Memorandum of Understanding	347
	<b>PART VI: COUNTRY EXPERIENCES</b>	<b>351</b>
<b>17.</b>	<b>BUDGET SUPPORT, AID DEPENDENCY, AND DUTCH DISEASE: THE CASE OF UGANDA</b>	<b>353</b>
	<i>Michael Atingi-Ego</i>	
	A. Patterns and Composition of Budget Support to Uganda, 1993–2003	354
	B. Implications of the Increase in Budget Support	356
	C. Prices of Tradables versus Nontradables	365
	D. Exchange Rate and Export Sector Competitiveness	366
	E. Policy Recommendations and Conclusions	367
<b>18.</b>	<b>BUDGET SUPPORT IN MOZAMBIQUE</b>	<b>371</b>
	<i>Gregor Binkert and Jose Sulemane</i>	
	A. MOU, Dialogue, Trust Building, and Harmonization	371
	B. Planning and Budgeting	372
	C. Monitoring and Evaluation of Budget Support	373
	D. Accountability	373
	E. Institutional and Human Capacity Building	374

<b>19. AFGHANISTAN: BUDGET SUPPORT IN A POSTCONFLICT ENVIRONMENT</b>	<b>375</b>
<i>Wahidullah Shabrani</i>	
<b>20. BUDGET SUPPORT AND POVERTY REDUCTION IN SOUTH ASIA</b>	<b>377</b>
<i>Shantayanan Devarajan and Shekhar Shah</i>	
A. Addressing South Asia's Development Challenges with Budget Support	379
B. Challenges Facing Budget Support in South Asia	387
<b>PART VII: DONOR PERSPECTIVES ON BUDGET SUPPORT</b>	<b>391</b>
<b>21. INTERNATIONAL MONETARY FUND PERSPECTIVE ON CONDITIONALITY</b>	<b>393</b>
<i>Atish Ghosh</i>	
A. Purposes of IMF Conditionality	393
B. 2002 Conditionality Guidelines	394
C. Lessons for Donors Providing Budget Support	395
<b>22. ENDING POLICY CONDITIONALITY: THE RECENT SHIFT IN THE UNITED KINGDOM'S AID POLICY</b>	<b>397</b>
<i>Nick Amin</i>	
A. Rationale for a New Conditionality Framework	399
B. How Will the New Policy Be Implemented?	400
C. Implications for Budget Support and Cooperation with Development Partners	403
D. Conclusion	405
<b>23. GERMANY'S PERSPECTIVE ON BUDGET SUPPORT</b>	<b>407</b>
<i>Ingrid-Gabriela Hoven</i>	
<b>24. DIRECT BUDGET SUPPORT, DISBURSEMENT MECHANISMS, AND PREDICTABILITY</b>	<b>411</b>
<i>Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation (NORAD)</i>	
A. The Use of Direct Budget Support	412
B. Causes and Consequences of Lack of Predictability	414
C. Graduated Response Mechanisms	416
D. The Way Forward	424
<b>25. BUDGET SUPPORT AND AID EFFECTIVENESS: EXPERIENCE IN EAST ASIA</b>	<b>431</b>
<i>Hiroto Arakawa</i>	
A. Definitions	432
B. Roles of Budget Support	433
C. Aid Coordination and Harmonization in Vietnam and the Philippines	436
D. Conclusion and Implications for Future Assistance to Africa	440

<b>26. THE NETHERLANDS: COUNTRY SELECTIVITY AND AID MODALITY CHOICES</b>	<b>447</b>	
<i>Maarten Brouwer</i>		
<b>PART VIII: PRACTITIONERS' FORUM ON BUDGET SUPPORT: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUDING REMARKS</b>	<b>451</b>	
<b>27. SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION</b>	<b>453</b>	
A. Budget Support: Concept, Instrument Choice, and Fiduciary Aspects	453	
B. Programmatic Alignment, Ownership, and Accountability	455	
C. Predictability and Macroeconomic Impact of Aid	457	
D. Donor Coordination and Conditionality	459	
<b>28. FORUM PARTICIPANTS' CONCLUDING REMARKS</b>	<b>463</b>	
Louis Kasekende	463	
Tertius Zongo	465	
Nick Amin	466	
Alan Gelb	469	
Mark Plant	470	
Jerome Morris Wolgin	474	
James Adams	475	
<b>REFERENCES</b>	<b>479</b>	
<b>BOXES</b>		
1.1	Definitions	6
1.2	Sector Budget Support	8
1.3	Recent and Ongoing Evaluations of Budget Support	10
4.1	What Does "Results" Mean?	82
4.2	Frequently Asked Questions about the Commission's Approach to Budget Support	88
7.1	Summary of Findings—General Budget Support in Tanzania	137
9.1	Fostering Intra- and Inter-ministerial Cooperation in Burkina Faso	167
9.2	Tanzania: the Participatory Public Expenditure Review and the PRSP Process	170
9.3	Bolivia: Incentivizing Pro-poor Spending at the Local Level	175
9.4	Uganda: Poverty Criteria as a Guide to Budget Allocations	184
10.1	Why the APR Is Not Adequate for Budget Support Financing Decisions: Examples from Africa	200
13.1	Good Practice in Different Country Circumstances	288
18.1	Budget Support and the Aid Relationship in Mozambique	372
22.1	Essential Elements of the UK Policy	398
25.1	Aid Enhancement Efforts in Vietnam	437
25.2	Aid Enhancement Efforts in the Philippines	438

## FIGURES

1.1	Decision Tree for Choosing Aid Instruments	11
1.2	Spectrum of Instruments	13
3.1	Sectoral and Thematic Content among PRSCs	58
3.2	Sectoral Distribution of Binding Measures in PRSCs and Other DPL Operations	59
3.3	Thematic Distribution of Binding Measures in PRSCs and Other DPL Operations	60
3.4	Increased Predictability and Volume of Bank Disbursements to PRSC Countries	75
4.1	Typical Elements of Each Year's Operation in a Fixed + Variable Tranche Program	82
4.2	Average Number of Conditions	86
4.3	Average Composition of a Variable Tranche	87
4.4	Average Yearly Disbursement Rate	87
5.1	Program Aid	94
5.2	The Evaluation Framework: A Simplified Version	96
5.3	Main Elements of the Evaluation	99
5.4	The Evaluation Framework	100
6.1	Joint Donor Categorization of Program Assistance	107
7.1	Simplified Logical Framework	123
7.2	The Changing Composition of Aid	125
7.3	Increasing Discretionary Funding in the Budget	127
7.4	Budgets versus Receipts, by Revenue Source	128
7.5	Real per Capita Spending on Priority Sectors	129
7.6	Sector Shares for Priority and Nonpriority Sectors	130
7.7	Expanding Service Delivery in Health and Education	131
8.1	The Hypothesis—How GBS Might Affect Public Financial Management Outcomes	140
8.2	Uganda and Tanzania: Program Aid as a Proportion of Aid and Public Expenditure	142
8.3	Uganda and Tanzania: Trends in Public Financial Management Outcomes	143
8.4	Uganda and Tanzania: Improved Strategic Resource Allocation—Pro-poor Public Expenditures	144
8.5	Uganda: Increasing Efficiency of Public Spending	145
8.6	Trends in Public Financial Management Systems in Uganda and Tanzania	146
9.1	Tanzania: Real per Capita Expenditures in Priority Sectors, FY99–FY06	179
9.2	Burkina Faso: Real per Capita Expenditure in Priority Sectors and Core Priority Areas, 1989–2002	180
9.3	Tanzania: Per Capita Spending by Priority Sector, FY99 and FY03	180

9.4	Burkina Faso: Real per Capita Spending in Priority Sectors, FY99 and FY02	181
9.5	Burkina Faso: Shares of Priority and Nonpriority Expenditure in Total Discretionary Spending, 1998–2002	182
9.6	Tanzania: Percentage Change in Priority and Nonpriority Expenditures, FY00–FY06	182
9.7	Tanzania: Projected and Disbursed External Assistance	188
9.8	Burkina Faso: Budget Support—Quarterly Disbursements	189
11.1	Program versus Project Aid	220
11.2	Deviations between Actual and Projected Budget Aid	223
11.3	Burkina Faso and Mali: Pattern of Budget Aid Disbursements over the Year	227
12.1	Buffer Stock Trajectory, $\lambda = 0.25$ , $S = 0.5$	239
12.2	Buffer Stock Trajectory, $\lambda = 0$ , $S = 0.5$	239
12.3	Buffer Stock Trajectory, $\lambda = 0.25$ , $S = 0.5$	240
12.4	Buffer Stock Trajectory, $\lambda = 0.5$ , $S = 0.5$	240
12.5	Anatomy of Major Shocks	241
12.6	Aid Allocation and Efficiency	243
12.7	Optimal Aid Allocations and the Quality of Policies and Institutions	246
12.8	Stability of Aid Flows, Standard Deviation 1999–2003, Share of 1999 Aid Flow	247
12.9	Potential Efficiency Losses in Optimal Allocation System from Errors in the CPIA	251
12.10	Expected Value of Efficiency Losses from Misestimation, by CPIA Level	252
12.11	Balancing Risks and Gains from Budget Support	254
12.12	Infant Mortality Rates, Estimated Paths for Different Performance Quantiles	258
12.13	Under-5 Mortality Rates, Estimated Paths for Different Performance Quantiles	259
13.1	Average Number of Conditions and Benchmarks per Lending Operation, FY1980–2005	273
13.2	Trends in the Share of Conditions by Thematic Area, FY1980–2005	275
15.1	Two Illustrations of “Failed” Program Operations	313
15.2	The All-in Matrix: Trust Made Rational	314
15.3	Model Structure	317
15.4	The “Game” between Donors and Recipients of Conditional Aid	319
15.5	Aid Volatility in Relation to Compliance with Conditionality	326
15.6	Ethiopia and Uganda: Volatility of World Bank–IMF Program Assistance in Relation to Compliance with Conditionality	327



15.7	Malawi and Zambia: Volatility of World Bank–IMF Program Assistance in Relation to Compliance with Conditionality	328
17.1	Budget Support Disbursements to Uganda, 1993–2003	354
17.2	Share of Multilateral and Bilateral Disbursements to Total Budget Support, 1993–2003	355
17.3	Liquidity Created by Fiscal Operations and the Fiscal Deficit, 1997–98 to 2003–04	358
17.4	Net Government Portfolio Liabilities to Nonresidents, February 2002–June 2004	361
17.5	Terms of Trade and Coffee, US\$ Export Price, 1992–93 to 2003–04	361
17.6	Export Diversification, 1992–93 to 2003–04	362
17.7	NEER, REER, and Shilling/US Dollar Exchange Rates, 1992–93 to 2002–03	363
17.8	NEER, REER, and Shilling/US Dollar Exchange Rates, January 2002 to September 2004	364
17.9	Prices of Tradables versus Nontradables, 1997–98 to 2002–03	365
20.1	Growth in South Asian Countries, 1981–2000	378
20.2	Poverty Trend in South Asia, 1990–2015	378
20.3	Fiscal Deficits of Indian States, 1985–86 to 2003–04	381
20.4	Primary Enrollment in Punjab, Pakistan, 1996–2004	385
24.1	Norwegian Debt Relief, Import Support, Balance of Payments, and Budget Support, 1990–2003	413
25.1	Development Policy Matrix	436
25.2	Vietnam: Effects of Different Aid Modalities on Policies and Systems	440
25.3	Tanzania: Effects of Different Aid Modalities on Policies and Systems	441
25.4	World Bank–IDA Strategic Framework for Assistance to Africa	444

## TABLES

2.1	Progress in Meeting Public Financial Management and Procurement Benchmarks	42
3.1	PRSC Countries and Commitments, FY2001–05	48
3.2	Evolution of Sectoral Content of PRSC Binding and Nonbinding Measures	61
3.3	Share of Public Financial Management Conditions in PRSCs	63
3.4	Harmonized Budget Support in PRSC Countries	68
3.5	Commitments and Actual Disbursements	73
4.1	Calculation of a Variable Tranche—Amount to be Disbursed	83
9.1	Key Characteristics of Budget Formulation	164
9.2	Cambodia: Shares of Current Expenditure, FY2000–FY05	181
11.1	Budget Aid and Tax Revenue: Deviations from Projections	221

## XIV | CONTENTS

11.2	Regressions of Actual Budget Aid on Projected Budget Aid	224
12.1	Percentage of Years with Negative Buffer Stock Balance	238
12.2	Countries by CPIA Quintiles, 1999	244
12.3	Countries by CPIA Quintiles, 2003	245
12.4	Type I Losses under Pure Precommitment	249
12.5	Type II Losses under Pure Precommitment	249
12.6	Simulated Efficiency Losses, Percent of Aid Flows for 2000–2003, Pure Precommitment	249
12.7	Type I Losses under Flexible Precommitment	250
12.8	Type II Losses under Flexible Precommitment	250
12.9	Simulated Efficiency Losses, Percent of Aid Flows for 2000–2003, Flexible Precommitment	251
12.10	Quantile Regressions on Annual Rate of Change in Infant Mortality	257
12.11	Quantile Regressions on Annual Rate of Change in under-5 Mortality	257
12.12	Annual Rates of Improvement in Infant Mortality (per 1,000)	257
13.1	Good Practice Principles	287
15.1	Notation	318
15.2	Results of SE Regression Analysis: Poverty, Growth, and Aid Characteristics	322
15.3	Case-study Countries: Experience of Budget Support Operations, Determinants of Trust and Aid Effectiveness	325
17.1	Budget Support Commitments/Disbursements in US\$ Millions, 1999–2000 to 2003–04	356
17.2	Outstanding Stock of Treasury Bills and Bonds and Foreign Exchange Sales to the Interbank Foreign Exchange Market, 1993–94 to 2003–04	359
24.1	Direct Budget Support in Percent of Total Bilateral Support from Norway and Some Other Donors, 2000–03	413
24.2	Example of a Variable Tranche Calculation in the EC Model	418
25.1	Modalities for ODA	432
25.2	Types of ODA Loans from the JBIC	433
25.3	Achieving the Goals of Budget Support through Project and Program Lending	442