

---

---

# Contents

<b>Preface</b> .....	<b>xiii</b>
<b>Acknowledgments</b> .....	<b>xv</b>
<b>1 Improving Teaching and Learning through Effective Incentives</b> .....	<b>1</b>
Lessons from Education Reforms in Latin America	
<i>Emiliana Vegas and Ilana Umansky</i>	
Introduction .....	1
Why and How Do Incentives Matter? .....	3
Incentives as a Broad and Complex Concept .....	4
Teacher Effectiveness and Student Performance .....	4
A Wide System Affecting Teaching and Learning .....	6
Education Reforms, Teaching Quality, and Student Learning .....	6
Review of Chapters .....	7
Improving Teaching Quality and Student Learning through Incentives .....	13
An Agenda for Further Research on Teacher Incentives .....	15
<b>2 A Literature Review of Teacher Quality and Incentives</b> .....	<b>21</b>
Theory and Evidence	
<i>Ilana Umansky</i>	
Introduction .....	21
Principal-Agent Theory: Description and Critiques .....	22
Teacher Quality and Its Determinants .....	25
Current Educational Investment and Policies and Their Embedded Incentives .....	28
Merit Pay .....	35
School Organization .....	43
Political Economy of Reform .....	47
Summary and Conclusions .....	49

<b>3</b>	<b>Are Teachers Well Paid in Latin America and the Caribbean?</b> . . . . .	<b>63</b>
	Relative Wage and Structure of Returns of Teachers <i>Werner Hernani-Limarino</i>	
	Introduction . . . . .	63
	How Can We Determine If Teachers Are Well Paid? . . . . .	65
	Are Teachers Well Paid? . . . . .	74
	Conclusions . . . . .	96
<b>4</b>	<b>Teachers' Salary Structure and Incentives in Chile</b> . . . . .	<b>103</b>
	<i>Alejandra Mizala and Pilar Romaguera</i>	
	Introduction . . . . .	103
	Who Are Chile's Teachers? . . . . .	104
	How Teachers' Salaries Are Determined . . . . .	105
	Changes in Teachers' Salaries . . . . .	107
	Effect of Salary Trends on Individuals Applying to Study Education . . . . .	110
	Analysis of Relative Teacher Pay . . . . .	115
	Incentives Embedded within Teachers' Salary Structure . . . . .	127
	Effect of the SNED on Schools' Academic Achievement: A Preliminary Evaluation . . . . .	131
	Evaluating Performance and Incentives: Teachers' and Principals' Perceptions . . . . .	141
	Conclusions . . . . .	144
<b>5</b>	<b>Educational Finance Equalization, Spending, Teacher Quality, and Student Outcomes</b> . . . . .	<b>151</b>
	The Case of Brazil's FUNDEF <i>Nora Gordon and Emiliana Vegas</i>	
	Introduction . . . . .	151
	Background on Brazil's Education System and FUNDEF . . . . .	154
	Data . . . . .	158
	Empirical Strategy . . . . .	168
	Findings . . . . .	173
	Conclusions and Policy Implications . . . . .	182
<b>6</b>	<b>Arbitrary Variation in Teacher Salaries</b> . . . . .	<b>187</b>
	An Analysis of Teacher Pay in Bolivia <i>Miguel Urquiola and Emiliana Vegas</i>	
	Introduction . . . . .	187

	Data . . . . .	189
	Teacher Pay in Bolivia . . . . .	189
	What Does the Pay Scale Reward? . . . . .	192
	The Flow of Teachers through the Salary Structure . . . . .	197
	Arbitrary Variation in Teacher Salaries . . . . .	200
	Conclusions . . . . .	210
<b>7</b>	<b>Teacher and Principal Incentives in Mexico</b> . . . . .	<b>213</b>
	<i>Patrick J. McEwan and Lucrecia Santibáñez</i>	
	Introduction . . . . .	213
	The Carrera Magisterial Program . . . . .	216
	Data . . . . .	217
	Allocation of Promotions . . . . .	222
	Empirical Strategy . . . . .	228
	Results for Teachers . . . . .	235
	Results for Principals . . . . .	245
	Conclusions . . . . .	249
<b>8</b>	<b>Decentralization of Education, Teacher Behavior, and Outcomes</b> . . . . .	<b>255</b>
	The Case of El Salvador's EDUCO Program <i>Yasuyuki Sawada and Andrew B. Ragatz</i>	
	Introduction . . . . .	255
	The Case of El Salvador's EDUCO Program . . . . .	257
	Empirical Analysis of the EDUCO Program . . . . .	262
	Conclusions . . . . .	300
<b>9</b>	<b>Teacher Effort and Schooling Outcomes in Rural Honduras</b> . . . . .	<b>307</b>
	<i>Emanuela di Gropello and Jeffery H. Marshall</i>	
	Introduction . . . . .	307
	Analytical Framework . . . . .	308
	Results . . . . .	314
	Conclusions . . . . .	353
<b>10</b>	<b>Teacher Incentives and Student Achievement in Nicaraguan Autonomous Schools</b> . . . . .	<b>359</b>
	<i>Caroline E. Parker</i>	
	Introduction . . . . .	359
	Nicaraguan Context . . . . .	359

Nicaraguan Autonomy .....	360
Methods .....	367
Results .....	378
Conclusions .....	383
<b>11 Political Economy, Incentives, and Teachers' Unions .....</b>	<b>389</b>
Case Studies in Chile and Peru	
<i>Luis Crouch</i>	
Background .....	389
Case Study of Chile: Reforms Designed and Implemented, Effect Yet to Be Seen .....	390
Case Study of Peru: Incentives Reforms Underdesigned, Unimplemented .....	405
Toward a Conclusion: Unions, Incentives, and Educational Progress in Latin America .....	417
<b>Figures</b>	
1.1 Many Types of Teacher Incentives Exist .....	5
3.1 Unconditional Log Hourly Wage and Monthly Earnings Differential .....	66
3.2 Hours Worked Per Week .....	67
3.3 Unconditional Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Different Samples of Nonteachers .....	78
3.4 Conditional Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Different Samples of Nonteachers: Estimated Coefficient for the Teachers' Dummy .....	80
3.5 Productivity Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Different Samples of Nonteachers: Estimated Endowment Effect from the Oaxaca Decomposition .....	83
3.6 Conditional Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Different Samples of Nonteachers: Estimated Price Effect from the Oaxaca Decomposition .....	85
3.7 Contribution of the Difference in the Return to Schooling to the Conditional Log Wage Differential .....	88
3.8 Contribution of the Difference in the Returns to Potential Experience to the Conditional Log Wage Differential .....	89
3.9 Contribution of the Difference in Women's Wage Premiums to the Conditional Log Wage Differential .....	91
3.10 Contribution of the Difference in Rural Residence Wage Premium to the Conditional Log Wage Differential .....	92
3.11 Contribution of the Difference in Initial Wage to the Conditional Log Wage Differential .....	93

3.12 Conditional Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Nonteachers by Quantile of the Conditional Wage Distribution .....	95
4.1a Hourly Income Distribution of Teachers and All Nonteachers, 1998 .....	118
4.1b Hourly Income Distribution of Teachers and Nonteachers with 13 or More Years of Schooling, 1998 .....	118
4.1c Hourly Income Distribution of Teachers and Nonteachers with 17 or More Years of Schooling, 1998 .....	119
4.2a Hourly Income Distribution of Teachers and All Nonteachers, 2000 .....	119
4.2b Hourly Income Distribution of Teachers and Nonteachers with 13 or More Years of Schooling, 2000 .....	120
4.2c Hourly Income Distribution of Teachers and Nonteachers with 17 or More Years of Schooling, 2000 .....	120
4.3a Salary Differentials between Female Teachers and Nonteachers, 1998 .....	128
4.3b Salary Differentials between Male Teachers and Nonteachers, 1998 .....	128
4.4 Allowances and Monetary Incentives for Teachers, 2002/03 .....	130
4.5 Responses of Principals: "I Agree or Strongly Agree with MINEDUC Regularly Evaluating Schools Receiving State Subsidies" .....	143
4.6 Responses of Principals: "I Agree or Strongly Agree That MINEDUC Should Provide Resources for Regularly Rewarding the Best Performing Schools" .....	143
4.7 Responses of Principals: "It Is 'Very Useful,' 'Somewhat Useful,' 'Useful' to Principal's Work That There Is a Monetary Award to Teachers, Associated with School Performance, Financed and Designed to MINEDUC Standards" .....	144
5.1 Evolution of Enrollment in Basic Education, by Level and Region, 1996–2002: EF1 .....	159
5.2 Evolution of Enrollment in Basic Education, by Level and Region, 1996–2002: EF2 .....	160
5.3 Gross Primary Enrollment Rates by Region, 1994–2000 .....	160
5.4 Net Primary Enrollment Rates by Region, 1994–2000 .....	161
5.5 Percentage of Qualified Teachers by Region, 1996–2002 .....	162
6.1 Salary Progression for Urban Teachers of All Training Levels ..	194
6.2 Distributions of Salaries for Urban and Rural Teachers .....	203
6.3 GIS Data for Santa Cruz Schools .....	209
7.1 Fitted Values of Promotion on Final Points, by Year, for Teachers .....	225

7.2	Fitted Values of Promotion on Final Points, by Year, for Principals .....	227
7.3	Stylized Portrayal of Empirical Strategy .....	232
7.4	Fitted Values of Classroom Test Scores on Initial Points, by Bandwidth for Teachers .....	235
7.5	Kernel Densities of Test Score for Teachers .....	239
7.6	Fitted Values of Classroom Test Scores on Initial Points, by Bandwidth and State, for Teachers .....	241
7.7	Test Scores and Pupil-Teacher Ratios in Year 10 for Teachers ..	245
7.8	Fitted Values of Classroom Test Scores on Initial Points, by Bandwidth for Principals .....	246
7.9	Fitted Values of Classroom Test Scores on Initial Points, by Bandwidth and State .....	248
8.1	Comparison of EDUCO and Traditional Governance Structures .....	259
8.2	OLS Estimated Coefficients on the EDUCO Variable for Major Influence Level of Key Administrative Processes ....	274
8.3	Estimated Coefficients for EDUCO Perceived Amount of Influence Compared with Traditional Schools .....	275
9.1	Model of Effective Community School, With (Some) Testable Hypotheses .....	310
<b>Tables</b>		
3.1	Household Surveys .....	73
3.2	Occupational Codes Included in the Definition of Teachers .....	75
3.3	Size of Teachers' Sample .....	77
3.4	Alternative Definitions of Nonteachers .....	77
3.5	Unconditional Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Different Samples of Nonteachers: $\ln(\text{GTN} + 1)$ .....	79
3.6	Conditional Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Different Samples of Nonteachers: Estimated Price Effect from the Oaxaca Decomposition: $E[\ln(wT)\backslash X] - E[\ln(wN)\backslash X]$ .....	81
3.7	Conditional Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Different Samples of Nonteachers: Estimated Price Effect from the Oaxaca Decomposition: $\ln(\text{DTN} + 1)$ .....	84
3.8	Productivity Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Different Samples of Nonteachers: Estimated Endowment Effect from the Oaxaca Decomposition: $\ln(\text{QTN} + 1)$ .....	86
3.9	Conditional Log Wage Differential between Teachers and Sample 1 of Nonteachers by Quantile .....	96
4.1	Monthly Real Salaries of Full-Time (44 Hours) Teachers .....	107
4.2	Comparison of Teachers' Salaries with the Average Wage and Professionals' Salaries .....	108

4.3	Comparison of Teachers' Starting Salary with the National Minimum Wage .....	109
4.4	International Comparisons of Teachers' Salaries, 2001 .....	111
4.5	Total Expenditures of the Ministry of Education, 1990-2001 ...	113
4.6	Average Score for Admission to Teaching Programs .....	115
4.7	Means and Standard Deviations of Selected Variables in a Comparison of Teachers and Nonteachers, 1998 and 2000 .....	117
4.8	Determinants of Labor Income, Teachers Compared with Nonteachers, 1998 .....	122
4.9	Factors Determining Labor Income, Teachers Compared with Nonteachers, 2000 .....	123
4.10	Breakdown of the Wage of an Average Municipal Sector Teacher, 2003 .....	130
4.11	SNED: Beneficiaries and Resources .....	132
4.12	Trends in SNED Award Amounts .....	133
4.13	SNED's Effect on Effectiveness .....	139
4.14	SNED Relationship to Effectiveness .....	140
5.1	Mean Per Pupil Spending and Enrollment Rates by Region. ....	155
5.2	Share of Teachers in Grades 1-4 with Credentials Higher Than Primary Education, 1996 .....	156
5.3	Sources and Distribution Mechanisms of FUNDEF Funds, by Government Level .....	157
5.4	Number of Teachers by Level, Region, and Year .....	161
5.5	Mean Pupil-to-Teacher Ratio by Level, Region, and Year .....	162
5.6	Age-by-Grade Distortion by Region, Level, and Year .....	163
5.7	Annual FUNDEF Per Pupil Allocations by Region, State, and Year .....	165
5.8	Mean Per Pupil Spending, by Region and Year .....	166
5.9	Mean Net FUNDEF Per Pupil Allocation and Mean Per Pupil Expenditures, 1998-2002 .....	167
5.10	Means, Standard Deviations, and Gini Coefficients for SAEB Language Scores in 1995, 2001 .....	167
5.11	Means, Standard Deviations, and Gini Coefficients for SAEB Mathematics Scores in 1995, 2001 .....	168
5.12	Stage 1: Effect of Mandated Educational Spending on Actual Educational Spending .....	173
5.13	Stage 1: Effect of Mandated Educational Spending on Actual Per Pupil Educational Spending, by Geographic Region .....	174
5.14	Stage 1: With Year-Specific Predictors .....	174
5.15	State-Level Effects of Spending on Enrollment, by Level .....	175
5.16	Effects of Educational Spending Per Pupil on Class Size, by Level .....	177

5.17	Effects of Educational Spending Per Pupil on Share of Teachers with Credentials Higher Than Primary Education, by Level . . . . .	178
5.18	Effects of Educational Spending Per Pupil on Age-by-Grade Distortion, by Level . . . . .	179
5.19	Effects of Education Inputs on Age-by-Grade Distortion, by Level . . . . .	180
5.20	Estimated Effect of Changes in State-Level Mean Per Pupil Spending on Mathematics Student Achievement by Percentile . . . . .	181
5.21	Estimated Effect of Changes in State-Level Inequality in Per Pupil Spending on Mathematics Student Achievement by Percentile . . . . .	181
6.1	Base Salaries by Geographic Region and Training Status . . . . .	190
6.2	Seniority-Based Pay Increases: Escalafón. . . . .	191
6.3	Salary Structure . . . . .	192
6.4	A Hypothetical Decomposition of the Teacher Wage Bill . . . . .	195
6.5	A Decomposition of the Teacher Wage Bill . . . . .	196
6.6	Distribution of Teachers by Geographic Region and Training Status. . . . .	199
6.7	Distribution of Teachers by Training and Experience . . . . .	199
6.8	Types of Schools in the Three Largest Cities . . . . .	201
6.9	Descriptive Statistics on Teachers . . . . .	202
6.10	Hours Worked and the Probability of Holding a Second Teaching Job. . . . .	204
6.11	Student Characteristics in Urban and Rural Schools . . . . .	206
6.12	Hours Worked by Teachers and Probability of Holding a Second Job . . . . .	207
7.1	Evaluation Scheme for Carrera Magisterial. . . . .	217
7.2	Teacher Promotions in Carrera Magisterial . . . . .	219
7.3	Principal Promotions in Carrera Magisterial . . . . .	220
7.4	Descriptive Statistics for Teachers. . . . .	221
7.5	Descriptive Statistics for Principals. . . . .	222
7.6	Determinants of Teacher Promotion, by State. . . . .	226
7.7	Determinants of Principal Promotion, by State. . . . .	229
7.8	Teachers' Initial Points and Classroom Test Scores . . . . .	237
7.9	Teachers' Initial Points and Classroom Test Scores, within Narrow Bands. . . . .	238
7.10	Teachers' Initial Scores and Classroom Test Scores: Difference-in-Differences. . . . .	242
7.11	Principals' Initial Points and School Performance Scores . . . . .	247
7.12	Principals' Initial Scores and Classroom Test Scores: Difference-in-Differences. . . . .	249
8.1	Means and Standard Deviations of Municipality-Level Socioeconomic Variables . . . . .	261

8.2	Means and Standard Deviations of Child and Household Variables, by School Type . . . . .	262
8.3	Means and Standard Deviations of School, Teacher, Classroom, and Community Variables, by School Type . . . . .	263
8.4	The Format of Questions on the Administrative Process . . . . .	265
8.5	Means and Standard Deviations of Decentralization and Perceived Influence Variables . . . . .	269
8.6	Means and Standard Deviations for Control Variables Used in Administrative Process Regressions . . . . .	271
8.7	Level of Decentralization: Comparison of OLS Results to Propensity Score and Treatment Effects Results . . . . .	278
8.8	Influence Level by Group: Comparison of OLS Results to Propensity Score and Treatment Effects Results . . . . .	279
8.9	Means and Standard Deviations of Control Variables Used in Teacher Behavior Regressions . . . . .	287
8.10	Means and Standard Deviations of Control Variables Used in Teacher Behavior Regressions . . . . .	290
8.11	Comparison of OLS Results to Treatment Effects and Propensity Score Matching Results . . . . .	292
8.12	Means and Standard Deviations of Student Achievement Test Scores . . . . .	297
8.13	Estimated EDUCO Effects on Mathematics Scores . . . . .	298
8.14	Estimated EDUCO Effects on Spanish Scores. . . . .	299
8.15	Estimated Effects on Days of Absence . . . . .	300
9.1	Sample Overview: Number of Students and Schools (in Parentheses), by Department . . . . .	316
9.2	Comparisons of Student and Family Characteristics among PROHECO and Control Samples . . . . .	317
9.3	Comparisons of School Characteristics between PROHECO and Control Samples . . . . .	318
9.4	Comparisons of Teachers' Characteristics . . . . .	319
9.5	Comparisons of Teacher Work Hours and Absences . . . . .	320
9.6	Comparisons of Teacher Salaries and Payment "Issues". . . . .	322
9.7	Teacher Earnings Equations. . . . .	323
9.8	Comparisons of Teaching Strategies . . . . .	325
9.9	Comparisons of Teacher Planning Strategies, Part 1 . . . . .	326
9.10	Comparisons of Teaching Strategies, Part 2. . . . .	327
9.11	Comparisons of Teacher Attitudes, Part 1 . . . . .	328
9.12	Comparisons of Teacher Attitudes, Part 2 . . . . .	329
9.13	Comparisons of School Environments According to Students . . . . .	330
9.14	School Characteristics According to Directors . . . . .	332
9.15	PROHECO Parameter in Regressions of Teacher and School Effort on Various Groupings of Variables. . . . .	334
9.16	Summary of Test Scores . . . . .	336

9.17 OLS Estimates of Determinants of Spanish Achievement, 2002 and 2003. . . . . 337

9.18 OLS Estimates of Determinants of Mathematics Achievement, 2002 and 2003. . . . . 339

9.19 OLS Estimates of Determinants of Science Achievement, 2002 and 2003. . . . . 341

9.20 Breakdown of PROHECO and Control School Achievement Differences, 2003. . . . . 346

9.21 First-Stage Equations: Binary Probit Estimates of PROHECO Participation, 2002 and 2003. . . . . 348

9.22 Comparison of PROHECO Achievement Effect Using Predicted and Actual Measure of PROHECO Participation, 2002 and 2003 . . . . . 349

9.23 Ordered Probit Estimates of Student-Reported Absences, 2002 and 2003. . . . . 352

9.24 OLS Estimates of Determinants of School Average Repetition and Dropout Rates, 2002 and 2003. . . . . 354

10.1 Control Variables: Third-Grade Mean Values, by School Type. . . 371

10.2 Years of School Autonomy, Third Grade . . . . . 372

10.3 Third-Grade Descriptive Statistics for Incentive Variables . . . . 372

10.4 Third-Grade Descriptive Statistics for Infrastructure and Material Resources, by School Type. . . . . 373

10.5 Third-Grade Descriptive Statistics for Professional Development, by School Type . . . . . 374

10.6 Third-Grade Achievement Scores, by School Type. . . . . 374

10.7 Third-Grade Spanish and Math Scores, by Years of Autonomy . . 374

10.8 Control Variables: Sixth-Grade Mean Values, by School Type . . 375

10.9 Years of School Autonomy, Sixth Grade. . . . . 376

10.10 Sixth-Grade Descriptive Statistics for Incentive Variables . . . . 376

10.11 Sixth-Grade Descriptive Statistics for Infrastructure/ Material Resources, by School Type. . . . . 377

10.12 Sixth-Grade Descriptive Statistics for Professional Development, by School Type . . . . . 377

10.13 Sixth-Grade Achievement Scores, by School Type . . . . . 378

10.14 Spanish and Math Scores, by Years of Autonomy . . . . . 378

10.15 Third-Grade Spanish Achievement . . . . . 379

10.16 Third-Grade Mathematics Achievement . . . . . 380

10.17 Third-Grade Mean Difference in Scores between Autonomous and Centralized Schools, by Process . . . . . 380

10.18 Sixth-Grade Spanish Achievement . . . . . 381

10.19 Sixth-Grade Math Achievement . . . . . 382

10.20 Sixth-Grade Mean Difference in Scores between Autonomous and Centralized Schools, by Process . . . . . 382

11.1 Relationship of Incentives to Attributability of Results. . . . . 403

11.2 Promotion Criteria According to Ley del Profesorado . . . . . 408