

04/1/02

74244

# Contents

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>  | <i>xv</i>   |
| <i>Acronyms and Abbreviations</i>                                 | <i>xvii</i>   |
| <i>Executive Summary</i>  | <i>xix</i>  |
| <b>Introduction</b>   | <b>1</b>  |
| Context, Purpose, and General Approach                            | 1   |
| Specific Focus, Conceptual Framework, and Methodological Approach | 4   |
| Structure of the Report   | 6   |
| <b>Chapter 1</b>  | <b>Trends and Challenges in Latin American and East Asian Secondary Education</b>       |
|   | <b>9</b>  |
|   | Introduction  |
|   | 9   |
|   | Secondary Education Structure   |
|   | 11  |
|   | Provision of Secondary Education: Public and Private, Academic and Technical/Vocational |
|   | 12  |
|   | Governance  |
|   | 17  |
|   | Secondary Education Coverage  |
|   | 26  |
|   | Internal Efficiency   |
|   | 32  |
|   | The Quality of Secondary Education  |
|   | 38  |
|   | The Validity of Access and Quality Trade-Offs   |
|   | 44  |

Donación

|                  |  |            |
|------------------|--|------------|
|                  | Indicators of Educational Equity in Secondary Education  | 49         |
|                  | Demand and Supply Constraints and Opportunities for Secondary Education  | 56         |
|                  | Conclusion   | 60         |
| <b>Chapter 2</b> | <b>Demand for Secondary Education in Latin America and East Asia</b>   | <b>67</b>  |
|                  | Introduction   | 67         |
|                  | Making Labor Markets Work for Young People   | 69         |
|                  | Patterns in average labor market returns   | 69         |
|                  | Trends in returns from and demand for secondary education  | 73         |
|                  | Heterogeneity in returns and labor market distortions  | 74         |
|                  | Increasing returns and school quality  | 79         |
|                  | Uncertainty about future returns from education  | 85         |
|                  | Information on Schools for Better Choices and Accountability   | 86         |
|                  | Incentives to Alleviate Credit Constraints   | 91         |
|                  | The role of credit constraints   | 91         |
|                  | Policies to alleviate credit constraints   | 94         |
|                  | Incentives to Address Competing Options  | 96         |
|                  | Incentives to alter the choice between school and work   | 97         |
|                  | Changing the relative price of schooling options: School vouchers  | 102        |
|                  | Conclusion   | 104        |
| <b>Chapter 3</b> | <b>Secondary Education Finance in Latin America and East Asia: Challenges and Opportunities in the Next Decade</b> | <b>115</b> |
|                  | Introduction   | 115        |
|                  | The State of the Secondary Education Sector:   |            |
|                  | Demographic and Economic Trends, Enrollments, and Current Finances   | 116        |
|                  | Demographic trends, economic factors, and enrollment rates   | 117        |
|                  | Sources of finance   | 118        |
|                  | Per pupil expenditures at the secondary level and the relative importance of secondary education                   | 121        |

|                  |   |            |
|------------------|---|------------|
|                  | What Is the Fiscal Gap? What Will It Be<br>in 10 Years?   | 125        |
|                  | Static estimates: The financial gap in 2003   | 129        |
|                  | Cost of quality (and demand-side interventions)   | 132        |
|                  | Forward-looking estimates (2003–15)   | 133        |
|                  | Mobilizing New Resources for Secondary<br>Education: What Are the Options?  | 136        |
|                  | The public sector: Increase public secondary<br>education expenditures  | 141        |
|                  | Encourage/allow for additional private funds<br>for secondary education   | 157        |
|                  | Seek an increase in international donor<br>contribution at the secondary level  | 166        |
|                  | Summing It Up: What Are the Shared Character-<br>istics among Countries That Have Successfully<br>Expanded Their Secondary Education? | 168        |
| <b>Chapter 4</b> | <b>Measuring and Improving Efficiency of Secondary<br/>Education in Latin America and East Asia</b>                                   | <b>181</b> |
|                  | Introduction  | 181        |
|                  | Efficiency/Production Frontier Analysis   | 182        |
|                  | What do we mean by efficiency?  | 182        |
|                  | Main results  | 185        |
|                  | Efficiency Constraints and Efficiency-Enhancing<br>Interventions  | 190        |
|                  | Impact of expenditure allocation  | 190        |
|                  | Pedagogical and curricular practices  | 195        |
|                  | Management practices  | 210        |
|                  | Improvements in internal efficiency   | 225        |
|                  | Conclusions   | 232        |
| <b>Annex 1.1</b> | <b>Structure of Secondary Education</b>   | <b>243</b> |
| <b>Annex 1.2</b> | <b>Share of Total Secondary Enrollment Attending<br/>Private Schools (2002 data)</b>  | <b>245</b> |
| <b>Annex 1.3</b> | <b>Share of Secondary Total Enrollment Attending<br/>Technical and Vocational Schools</b>   | <b>246</b> |
| <b>Annex 1.4</b> | <b>Secondary School Enrollment Statistics,<br/>2002–03</b>  | <b>247</b> |
| <b>Annex 1.5</b> | <b>Enrollment by Age and Sex</b>  | <b>249</b> |

09/12/06

74244

11/11/06

|            |   |     |
|------------|---|-----|
| Annex 1.6  | Completion Graphs for Children Ages 13–19   | 255 |
| Annex 3.1  | Sources of Finance: Secondary Education,<br>School Year 2002–03   | 260 |
| Annex 3.2  | Domestic per Pupil Expenditure at the Secondary<br>Level, Measured in \$PPP and as % of<br>GDP per Capita, 2003 | 262 |
| Annex 3.3  | Discussion of the Methodology   | 264 |
| Annex 3.4  | Fiscal Gap Estimates for Various GER2 Targets   | 266 |
| Annex 4.1  | School Confidence Intervals Estimates—Output<br>Efficiency—PISA 2000  | 269 |
| Annex 4.2  | Budget Data   | 270 |
| Annex 4.3  | Annual Recurrent Cost of Repetition<br>in LAC and EAP, 2000   | 273 |
| References |   | 275 |
| Index      |   | 299 |

### Tables

|      |   |         |
|------|---|---------|
| ES.1 | Estimated Expenditure Need at GER2 = 85%<br>and Expenditure per Students as a<br>Percent of GDP = 26%             | xxix    |
| ES.2 | Static Categorization of Countries by Enrollment<br>and Measures of Education Quality                             | xxxv    |
| ES.3 | Priorities and Policies of Countries That Have<br>Addressed or Are Addressing Trade-Offs                          | xxxviii |
| ES.4 | Policy Alternatives by Constraint, Challenges, Income<br>Level, and Region  | xliii   |
| ES.5 | Typology of Public-Private Partnerships in East Asia<br>and Latin America   | lvi     |
| 1.1  | World Bank Categorization of East Asian and Latin<br>American Countries by Income Group as Used in<br>This Report | 10      |
| 1.2  | Characteristics of Private Secondary Schools in<br>PISA-Participating Latin American and<br>East Asian Countries  | 14      |
| 1.3  | Locus of Key Decisions in Lower Secondary Education<br>in Select East Asian Countries in 2003                     | 19      |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| 1.4  | Locus of Decision Making in Lower Secondary Education in Select Latin American Countries, 2000s                                     | 20  |
| 1.5  | Static Categorization of Countries by Enrollment and Measures of Education Quality  | 47  |
| 1.6  | East Asian and Latin American Countries Vary in Degree of Inequality  | 52  |
| 1.7  | Countries Characterized by Gender Inequity  | 53  |
| 1.8  | Countries Characterized by Main Type of Inequity  | 54  |
| 1.9  | Inequity Trends across Time   | 54  |
| 1.10 | Countries Characterized by Whether Children Exit the School System within or between Cycles   | 59  |
| 2.1  | Average Returns and Years of Schooling of Adult Wage Earners, by Sex  | 70  |
| 2.2  | Stock of Education among the Adult Working Population   | 71  |
| 2.3  | Pattern of Returns by Public-Private Employment, Males  | 79  |
| 2.4  | Share of Education Costs from Total per Capita Household Expenditures   | 93  |
| 2.5  | Possible Demand-Side Policy Instruments to Alleviate Constraints  | 95  |
| 3.1  | Latin American and Caribbean and East Asian and Pacific Developing Countries Grouped by GER2: Enrollment Trends and Economic Trends | 118 |
| 3.2  | Total Education Expenditure at Secondary Level as Percent of GDP in Selected Countries, by Sources of Funding, 2003                 | 120 |
| 3.3  | Public Primary and Secondary School Teacher Salaries, Selected Countries (2001)   | 124 |
| 3.4  | Observed Parameters of the Model  | 130 |
| 3.5  | 2003 Estimated Fiscal Gap, with Current Cost Structures (target GER2 = 85%)   | 131 |
| 3.6  | 2003 Estimated Fiscal Gap, with OECD Unit Costs (target GER2 = 85%)   | 133 |
| 3.7  | Average Change in School-Age Cohort and Total Population, 2003–15   | 135 |
| 3.8  | Estimated Expenditure Need at GER2 = 85% and $c_{2015} = 26\%$  | 136 |
| 3.9  | Ancillary Services at Secondary Level, 2005: Selected Countries of East Asia and the Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbean    | 152 |
| 3.10 | Demand-Side Financing Schemes from Latin America and the Caribbean and East Asia and the Pacific                                    | 153 |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| 3.11 | Composition of Bilateral Education Assistance, Two-Year Averages for 2001–02   | 168 |
| 3.12 | Possibility of Acute Funding Shortages for Secondary Education   | 169 |
| 4.1  | Mean Input, Output Level for the Most Output-Efficient Schools and Comparison with Other Schools (East Asian and Pacific and Latin American and Caribbean countries)—PISA 2000 | 194 |
| 4.2  | Comparison of Mean Efficiency Scores across General/Technical Schools—PISA 2003  | 198 |
| 4.3  | Comparison of Output Efficiency by Use of Evaluation   | 204 |
| 4.4  | Some of the Major Existing Alternative Secondary Models in Latin America and the Caribbean and East Asia   | 206 |
| 4.5  | Comparison of Mean Output Efficiency Scores across Public and Private Management   | 214 |
| 4.6  | Comparison of Mean Output Efficiency Scores across Autonomy Categories   | 219 |
| 4.7  | Multivariate Results on Selected Latin American and Caribbean and East Asian and Pacific Countries—PISA 2000   | 221 |
| A1.1 | Structure of Primary and Secondary Education in Latin America  | 243 |
| A1.2 | Structure of Primary and Secondary Education Structure in East Asia  | 244 |

## Figures

|      |   |        |
|------|---|--------|
| ES.1 | Trend Line of PISA Test Scores against Log GDP per Capita for East Asian and Latin American Countries | xxii   |
| ES.2 | Performance and Inequality in PISA Scores (Math)  | xxiii  |
| ES.3 | Estimated Graduation Rates for Children Aged 13–19  | xxiv   |
| ES.4 | Returns to One More Year of Education by Quintile in Selected LAC Countries                           | xxvi   |
| ES.5 | Secondary per Pupil Expenditures (\$PPP), as percent of per Capita Income, 2002–03 School Year        | xxviii |
| ES.6 | Output Efficiency (in Terms of Academic Performance) in Selected EAP and LAC Countries—PISA 2000      | xxx    |

|       |  |       |
|-------|--|-------|
| ES.7  | Reducing Fiscal Gaps through Additional Resources and Efficiency Gains   | xxxii |
| ES.8  | Dynamic Categorization of Countries by Progress since the Mid-1990s in Enrollment and Measures of Quality            | xxxvi |
| ES.9  | Closing the Gap with Public Resources  | li    |
| ES.10 | Closing the Gap with Private Resources   | li    |
| ES.11 | Output Efficiency Scores by Public and Private Management  | lvii  |
| 1.1.  | Influence of Regional and National Decision Making in Staffing, Budgeting, Content, and Assessment Related Decisions | 23    |
| 1.2.  | Responsibility of School-Level Actors for Decisions on Hiring Teachers   | 24    |
| 1.3.  | Responsibility of School-Level Actors for Decisions on Budget Allocation   | 25    |
| 1.4.  | Responsibility of School-Level Actors for Decisions on Course Content  | 25    |
| 1.5.  | 2002–03 Secondary Gross and Net Enrollment and Annual Average Rate of Change   | 27    |
| 1.6   | (a) Secondary Gross Enrollment Trends across Time and (b) Lower Secondary School Completion Rates in 1997            | 28    |
| 1.7.  | Secondary Gross Enrollment: Much of Latin America and East Asia Is Low Given National Income                         | 30    |
| 1.8.  | Primary Gross Enrollment Rates by Log per Capita GDP   | 31    |
| 1.9.  | Enrollment by Age and Quintile in Two East Asian Countries: (a) Indonesia and (b) Cambodia                           | 34    |
| 1.10. | Enrollment by Age and Quintile in Two Latin American Countries: (a) Mexico and (b) Colombia                          | 35    |
| 1.11  | Estimated Completion Rates for Children Aged 13 to 19: (a) Argentina 2003, (b) Thailand 2002, and (c) Vietnam 2002   | 37    |
| 1.12  | PISA 2003 Test Score Results in Mathematics Literacy   | 39    |
| 1.13  | PISA 2000 Test Score Results in Reading Literacy   | 40    |
| 1.14  | Trend Line of PISA Test Scores against Log GDP per Capita for East Asian and Latin American Countries                | 42    |
| 1.15  | 2003 TIMSS Math Scores   | 43    |
| 1.16  | 2003 TIMSS Science Scores  | 43    |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| 1.17 | Dynamic Categorization of Countries by Progress since the Mid-1990s in Enrollment and Measures of Quality  | 48  |
| 1.18 | Completion Rate Graphs   | 51  |
| 1.19 | Level at Which Available Workers' Skills Are Considered a Business Constraint by Employers   | 57  |
| 2.1  | Annualized Average Returns of Male Wage Earners by School Level, Latin America and the Caribbean   | 72  |
| 2.2  | Annualized Average Returns of Male Wage Earners by School Level, East Asia and the Pacific   | 73  |
| 2.3  | Returns from One More Year of Education by Quintile in Selected Latin American and Caribbean and East Asian and Pacific Countries                  | 76  |
| 2.4  | Average Math Performance by Wealth   | 81  |
| 2.5  | Ranking of Countries according to Variance in Math Scores Explained by Wealth (PISA 2000)  | 82  |
| 2.6  | Between- and Within-School Variation in Math Scores (PISA 2000)  | 82  |
| 2.7  | Percentage of Between-School Variation in Math Scores Explained by Wealth  | 83  |
| 2.8  | Performance and Inequality in PISA Scores (math)   | 84  |
| 2.9  | Relationship between School and Work   | 98  |
| 3.1  | Total Education Expenditure, by Levels, as Percent of GDP, 2002–03   | 119 |
| 3.2  | Secondary per Pupil Expenditures (\$PPP), as Percent of per Capita Income, 2002–03 School Year   | 122 |
| 3.3  | Per Pupil Expenditures in PPP Converted Dollars in East Asia and the Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbean: Primary vs. Secondary Levels     | 123 |
| 3.4  | Ratio of Total Education Expenditures at the Secondary Education Level to the Total Education Expenditures at the Primary Level, 2002–03           | 125 |
| 3.5  | Relation between GER2 and (a) Secondary Education Expenditure, (b) per Pupil Expenditure, and (c) Secondary-School-Age Cohort, 2002–03 School Year | 128 |
| 3.6  | Expenditure Needs across Different GER Targets   | 131 |
| 3.7  | Marginal Cost of Quality, as a Percentage of GDP   | 134 |
| 3.8  | Secondary Education: Flow of Funds   | 137 |
| 3.9  | Closing the Gap with Public Resources  | 155 |
| 3.10 | Potential Resources from the Private Sector  | 167 |



|              |   |      |
|--------------|---|------|
| 4.1          | Output Efficiency (in grade attainment and academic performance) in Selected Countries of East Asia and the Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbean—PISA 2000 | 187  |
| 4.2          | Output Efficiency (in academic performance) in Selected Countries of East Asia and the Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbean—PISA 2000                      | 188  |
| 4.3          | Output Efficiency (in relation to academic performance) in Selected Countries of East Asia and the Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbean—PISA 2003          | 189  |
| 4.4          | Output Efficiency Scores and Nonsalary Shares in Selected Countries of East Asia and the Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbean                              | 193  |
| 4.5          | Technical and Vocational Enrollment Share and Secondary Pupil-Teacher Ratios for Selected Latin American and Caribbean and East Asian and Pacific Countries       | 197  |
| 4.6          | Private School Advantage before and after Controlling for Context and Selection—PISA 2000   | 213  |
| 4.7          | Efficiency by Public and Private Management   | 215  |
| 4.8          | Average Repetition Rate in Latin American and Caribbean and East Asian and Pacific Countries (unweighted)—2000  | 226  |
| 4.9          | Portion of Recurrent Expenditure due to Repetition in Selected East Asian and Pacific and Latin American and Caribbean Countries                                  | 227  |
| <b>Boxes</b> |   |      |
| ES.1         | Lessons from the Colombia-PACES Program   | xlix |
| ES.2         | Self-Financing Arrangements in China  | lv   |
| 2.1          | Integrated Approaches to Addressing Multiple Constraints Faced by Youth   | 87   |
| 2.2          | Vouchers in Colombia—Programa de Ampliación de la Educación Secundaria (PACES)  | 103  |
| 3.1          | Who Should Finance Secondary Education?   | 138  |
| 3.2          | Resource Mobilization in China: Decentralization and Diversification of Revenue Sources   | 143  |
| 3.3          | Formula Funding in Brazil: The FUNDEF Program   | 147  |

|                   |  |     |
|-------------------|--|-----|
| 3.4               | Cross-Sectoral Funding for Secondary Education in Mexico—The Oportunidades Program | 150 |
| 3.5               | Community Schools—The Case of Fe y Alegria in Latin America and the Caribbean      | 161 |
| 3.6               | Self-Financing Arrangements in China   | 164 |
| 4.1               | Efficiency Concepts and Measurement  | 184 |
| 4.2               | Curricular Reform and Alignment in Malaysia  | 201 |
| 4.3               | The Role of ICT in Alternative Models  | 207 |
| 4.4               | An Analysis of Efficient and Nonefficient Schools in Brazil and Indonesia          | 224 |
| 4.5               | Chile and Cambodia: Different Paths to Reducing Repetition                         | 230 |
| <br>              |  |     |
| <b>Spotlights</b> |  |     |
| 1                 | Brazil: Addressing Access and Quality  | 63  |
| 2                 | Mexico: Effective Combination of Supply- and Demand-Side Policies                  | 112 |
| 3                 | Vietnam: School Self-Financing Strategies to Improve Access and Quality            | 178 |
| 4                 | Korea: High Priority for Education and Effective Public-Private Partnership        | 240 |